ABSTRACTS

- **MARK SOILEAU,** Independent Scholar

Various Versions of the *Velâyetnâme*

A general overview of the extant copies of the text, highlighting the features that distinguish its different versions, with special attention to the use of verse.

- **CEMAL KAFADAR,** Harvard University

On the Textual Tradition of the Vitae of Hacı Bektaş

This paper offers some observations on the textual and manuscript history of the *Velayetname* of Hacı Bektaş based on the understanding that each manuscript copy of a book is an event in the history of that book.

- **AHMET KARAMUSTAFA**, University of Maryland

***Velâyetnâme* as an Historical Source**

The use of hagiographies as historical sources has generated much discussion in historiography in general, and scholars of Islam continue to approach sacred biographies of Muslim saints in diverse ways. In this presentation, I will tackle the question of the place of the *Velayetname* in the historical record of Alevi-Bektaşi history and offer some observations on how it can be utilized as a historical source.

- **SİBEL KOCAER,** Bandırma Onyedi Eylül Üniversitesi

The Portrayal of Hünkar Hacı Bektaş in the Fifteenth Century Narratives and the *Velāyetnāme*

The *Velāyetnāme* (1481-1501?), which is the core text of Bektashi literature, includes some common features, motifs and figures with the *Hızırnāme* (1476) and the *Saltuknāme* (c. 1480), which are two significant texts from different frontier regions of the Ottomans. The aim of this paper is to explore the portrayal of Hacı Bektaş in the fifteenth century with a particular focus on the *Hızırnāme*, the *Saltuknāme* and the *Velāyetnāme*, as the common elements in these texts serve to indicate a shared story being rewritten by closely related audience with alterations and new layers added depending on the context. With this aim, the identification of Hacı Bektaş with Khidr, the portrayal of Hacı Bektaş as the head of the *erenler*, their fight against the infidels, their deeds and the descriptions of the *erenler* will be examined with regards to the textual relations and historical context.

- **AYFER KARAKAYA-STUMP,** William & Mary

Velayetname*'s Intertextual Relationship to *Menakıb-ı Seyyid Ebü'l-Vefa

There is growing evidence in recent scholarship that reveals a relatively extensive Wafa'i presence in Anatolia since medieval times. Over time, however, the memory of the Wafa'iyya

appears to have been mostly erased as reflected in its absence from the later narrative sources. This amnesia was in part the result of the Wafa'i legacy's absorption into the Bektashi tradition through the intermediary of the Abdals of Rum. One way to trace this process of absorption and assimilation is by exploring *Velayetname*'s intertextual relationship with *Menakıb-ı Seyyid Ebü'l-Vefa* which is the intent of this presentation.

- **YURI STOYANOV,** SOAS-University of London
Alevi and Bektāşī Religious and Cultural Traditions and the Christian Heretical Imaginary

The paper intends to examine the provenance and main patterns of the application of the model of Christian heretical/heterodox impact on Alevism and Bektāşīsm from its early formulations within the competing regional nation/state-building programs of the Balkan post-Ottoman states to some of its most recent reiterations. The earlier formulations of the model evolved against the background of the dramatic ethno-confessional conflicts and transmutations of the late and post-Ottoman periods, hence the consequent approaches to the beliefs and history of Alevism and Bektāşīsm were strongly influenced by the grand interpretative narratives of Islamic-Christian interrelations in the Ottoman era (as advanced and instrumentalized in the contemporary Balkan national historiographies). More recent attempts to revive the model and impose it on the history and theology of Alevism and Bektāşīsm have been further prejudiced by application of dubious methodologies and strategies. These strategies (applied both in scholarly and general publications) have included the falsification of written primary source material and oral histories) to implement both traditional and post-secular ideological and ethno-confessional agendas.

- **VERNON SCHUBEL,** Kenyon College
My *Qiblah* is a Man: Teaching Islam Beyond the *Shari'ah*

I am currently in the process of finishing a new introductory book on Islam, *Teaching Humanity: an Alternative Introduction to Islam*, that emphasizes the diversity of the Muslim tradition. Throughout I foreground the Alevi-Bektaşi tradition as a corrective to the notion that Islam is best understood through the lens of the discursive tradition of *fiqh* and *shari'ah* rather than more affective and exploratory Sufi tradition. My paper will discuss ways of integrating teaching about the Alevi-Bektaşi tradition into courses on Islam. It will focus on the final chapter of my book which places the Alevi tradition within the larger Sufi tradition through a discussion of several key narratives including the *mirac* narrative from Buyruk, the account of Güvenç Abdal and the story of the lineage and birth of Hacı Bektaş in the *Vilayetname*.

- **EMIN LELIĆ,** Salisbury University
Between Kizilbash & Ottomans: Contesting "Turkish" Identity

Who is a "Turk?" This deceptively simple question is cloaked in immense historical (and, for that matter, present) significance. During the so-called "classical" Ottoman age it transcended mere ethnic identification and carried profound political implications. For, the "classical" Ottoman establishment, most pronouncedly its intellectual wing, saw "Turks" as unfit for membership in the ruling elite and vociferously denounced what they considered "Turkish" infiltration into the same. Yet, there were dissenting voices within the establishment, as well. Not all thought it wise to alienate the enormous martial potential of the "Turks" – most especially the Turkic tribes of Anatolia. Competing claims to sovereignty could easily transform the ostracized,

yet relatively neutral "Turks" into Kizilbash enemies, as the rise of the Safavid dynasty during the early sixteenth century demonstrated. Appearing to have learned its lesson, by the mid-sixteenth century, the Ottoman state was entering a phase of rapprochement with Anatolian "Turks" – increasingly, "Turks" came to be incorporated into the military-administrative establishment. This, in return, invigorated intellectual debates about the meaning of "Turk." Some Ottoman thinkers suggested circumventing the terminological problem altogether by inventing new terms to designate loyal Anatolian "Turks."

- **CEVAT DARGIN,** Princeton University
A Mobile and Invisible Religion: Dersim's Internal System and Rêa Heq

I define Dersim as a nonstate space and consider government policies towards it as internal colonization. Defining Dersim as a nonstate space raises a major question: How did Dersim's inhabitants regulate their internal affairs at the individual, family, tribe, and communal level without and despite the state? Answering this question requires understanding the local belief system, its relations with the tribal structure in the region, and with the natural environment of Dersim. In my presentation, I will do three things: Provide examples of how outsiders understood Dersim and the belief system of Dersim's Kizilbash Kurdish inhabitants in the historical context of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries; explain, in light of recent studies, how that belief system functioned in the absence of an administrative bureaucracy and often despite it; and identify the political consequences, both for the local inhabitants and the state authorities, of what some Turkish state authorities called "the Dersim system" (Dersim sistemi).

- **HÜSEYİN O. ARSLAN,** Çankırı Karatekin University
A Qizilbash Defense in an Ottoman Heresy Trial: An Example of the anti-Qizilbash Campaign under Selim I (1512–1520)

This paper examines a heresy trial that took place in Ottoman Anatolia during Selim I's reign (1512–1520) against an Ottoman Qizilbash. In the light of the sectarian aspect of the political rivalry between the Ottomans and the Safavids, and the severe measures the Ottomans took against their non-Sunni subjects, many modern scholars thought there must have been heresy trials against the Qizilbash. However, there are only a few records available regarding such trials. The little-known and unstudied record I analyze in my presentation has at its center a Qizilbash accused of heresy. This record is particularly significant because it was produced by another Qizilbash, an Ottoman subject at the time of the trial who later moved to the Safavid side. In this paper, I attempt to shed light on several issues regarding patterns of religiosity in the early sixteenth century in West Asia by discussing (i) how the procedures of heresy trials work; (ii) how the Qizilbash author turns the trial record into a Shi'i–Sunni polemic, therefore a Qizilbash propaganda, and (iii) how a Qizilbash defends his faith against a Sunni court.

▪ **HASAN HÜSEYİN GÜNEŞ,** Bartın Üniversitesi Tarih Bölümü
Osmanlı Ulemasının Rafızî Reddiyeleri Yazma Geleneği ve Bu Geleneğin Söylem Analizi

İslam tarihinde gayrisünni fırkalara yazılan reddiyeler genellikle "Râfızî" kavramı bağlamında yazılan geniş bir literatür oluşturmuştur. Bu literatürün Osmanlılar'daki izdüşümleri de azımsanmayacak boyuttadır. Bu tebliğ, Osmanlı uleması tarafından kaleme alınan Râfızî reddiyelerine odaklanmaktır. Araştırmalarımızın bulguları neticesinde reddiye geleneğinin mezhepsel boyutunun ötesinde, devletin resmî ideolojik söylemi için araçsallaştırılmış eserler olduğunu söylemek mümkündür. Araştırmamızda şu eserler kaynak olarak kullanılmıştır: Zeynelabidin el-Güranî el-Kurdî el-Hanefî'nin (öl. 1655) IV. Mehmed döneminde kaleme aldığı *Yemâniyyetu'l-Meslûle* isimli hacimli eser; XVI. yüzyıl ulemasından Muhammed el-Berkal'î'nin iki reddiyesi; Muhammed b. İskender adlı mechûl birinin Ebussuud'un fetvalarından derleyip meydana getirdiği *et-Tekfîru'ş-Şî'ati'ş-Şenî'a* isimli risale.

▪ **ÜMİT KATIRANCI,** Ankara Hacı Bayram Veli Üniversitesi
Tahrir Defterlerindeki "Kızılbaş" İfadelerine Dair Bir Değerlendirme

Bu çalışma, tahrir defterlerinde yer alan "Kızılbaş" ya da "sürh-ser" ifadelerinin tespitini ve defterlerde neden yer aldığı sorusunun cevabını bulmayı hedeflemektedir. Kayıtlarda "sürh-ser şodend" yani *Kızılbaş oldular* ifadesi ile "mâl-ı sürh-serân" ismi verilen bir tür vergi kaleminin varlığı tespit edilmiştir. Bazen bir yerleşim yerinin bazen de bir kişinin Kızılbaş olduğuna dair açıklamalar görülmektedir. Ayrıca, "Mâl-ı sürhserân" şeklinde geçen örfî bir vergi kalemi, genellikle padişah, bazen de sancakbeyi hasları arasında gösterilmiştir. İki devletin sınır boylarındaki coğrafyalar ve iç kısımları kültürel alışverişin ve dahi karşılıklı etkileşimin en yoğun yaşandığı bölgelerdir. Bu nedenle, çalışmada da bahse konu ifadeler, Diyarbekir, Mardin, Sincar, Çermik, Adana, Teke, Kemah, Karahisar-ı Şarki, Çorum, Canik, Trabzon gibi yerlere ait XVI. yüzyıldaki tahrir defterlerinde geçmektedir.

▪ **MURAT ALANDAĞLI**, Hakkâri Üniversitesi

Mecitözü Örneği Bağlamında Hurufat Kayıtlarının Alevilik-Bektaşilik Tarihi Araştırmalarına Katkısı

Alevilik-Bektaşilik araştırmacılarının belge temelli çalışmalarına rağmen, arşivdeki XVII-XIX. yüzyıllar arasını kapsayan defterlere pek meyletmedikleri anlaşılmaktadır. Bu meyandaki örneklerden biri Hurufat Defterleridir. Vakıflar Arşivindeki bu defterler, genellikle şehir tarihi veya cami, mescit, zaviye vb. eserlerin tarihsel geçmişi, işleyişi bağlamında ele alınmıştır. Çalışmamızda günümüz idarî sınırları bağlamında Mecitözü ve Ortaköy ilçeleri sınırlarında yer alan fakat kayıtların tutulduğu dönemde Sivas'ın Amasya Sancağı Mecitözü Kazası köylerinin hurufat kayıtları tetkik edilecektir. Bu vesileyle hurufat kayıtlarında "dede", "Hacı Bektaş-ı Veli", "Zaviye", "Tekke" şeklinde Alevi-Bektaşi literatürüne has kayıtlar tespit edilecektir.

▪ **SELİM GÜNGÖRÜRLER,** Austrian Academy of Sciences
The Qizilbaş in Anatolia after 1640: Sidelined and Estranged
This paper looks into the political estrangement of the Anatolian Qizilbaş after the Treaty of Zuhab (1639). The long-lasting peace that followed in Ottoman-Safavid dealings brought about the Ottoman-Sunni establishment's stepwise acknowledgement, at least by the state if not by the

clergy, of the Safavids' conversion from Qizilbaşism to Shiism. As the two monarchies grew politically near, the Ottomans' persecution of the Anatolian Qizilbash came to a halt. Therefore, the word Kızılbaş almost disappeared from Ottoman official documents, because the target community, now politically insignificant compared to before, was no longer a matter of state. Having thus lost their instrumentality for the Safavids and hence their potential to make up a fifth column against the Ottomans, they were taken off the stage of state-referenced politics on both sides. Whereas this shift may have lessened the sense of alarm felt by the Kızılbaş, it also made them politically hopeless. The word Kızılbaş's shifting from an endonym of pride to a supposed exonym of slur, and likewise, the Kızılbaş's figuratively going underground as a political and religious community, may therefore have stemmed not from the fight but from the rapprochement between the Ottoman and the Safavids.

- **ALİ ANĞAY,** Mardin Artuklu Üniversitesi
Zaman ve Mekân Bağlamında Babailer İsyani ve Dede Kargın

Tarihsel süreç içerisinde Anadolu coğrafyası içerisinde 1237 tarihinde belirli bir taasub dini topluluk tarafından dinsel faktörler nedeniyle çıkarıldığına inanılan ve Babai İsyan olarak adlandırılan tarihsel vakıa, filhakika bambaşka nedenler ve çok farklı aktörler ve tamamıyla farklı mekanlar etrafında organize olmuş bir olgudur. Selahaddin Eyyubi'nin vefat etmesi, Eyyubi hanedanını yeni arayışlara sevk etmiştir. Bölge siyasetini iyi bilmeleri ki burada özelikle Melik Şihabettin İlğazi, Melik Kamil ve Melik Eşref aktif rol almışlardır. Bu zevat Eyyubi sultanı Melik Adil'in çocukları olup yerel güçlerin siyasi emellerine vakıf olmaları hasebiyle en iyi devlet kurumu olan posta ve istihbarat teşkilatı YASEK birliklerini harekete geçirmişlerdir. Yasek birliklerinin ilk hedefi en güçlü savaşçı kitlesine sahip olan ve Ortadoğu'da haçlı mücadelesinde etkin tecrübeler edinmiş Çepni Türkmenleri ki bu grup daha çok Mardin-Dunaysir mevkiinde yerleşik olup Dede Kargın liderliğinde savaşçı özelikleri olan manevi eren kimliği ile içselleştirilmiş ve bu kültür minvalinden yaşam biçimini oluşturmuştur. İsyanın aktörlerinin Dede Kargın halifeleri olmaları ki burada özellikle Kefertutalı Baba İshak figürü, dikkat edilmesi gereken bir yapıya sahiptir, zamanlaması ve mekân faktörü açısından olayı net görmemize yardımcı olacaktır.

- **SAİM SAVAŞ,** Uşak Üniversitesi
Batı Anadolu'da Yesevi Geleneğinin İnşasında Üç Şeyh-Bir Cemaat: Hacı Bektaş-ı Velî, Hacım Sultan, Şeyh Dedebalı ve Dedebalılar Cemaati

1321 tarihli Hacım Sultan vakfiyesinde, Eş-Şeyh Dedebalı bin Eş-Şeyhü'l-Germiyanî/Kirmânî Şeyh Mustafa'nın Hacım Sultan Zaviyesine şeyh tayin edildiği görülüyor. Söz konusu vakıfla ilgili Fatih devri kayıtlarında, Hacım oğlu Dedebalı'nın vakfa mutasarrıf olduğu belirtiliyor. Koluaçık/Kulacık Hacım Sultan'ın ise Ahmet Yesevî tarafından Anadolu'yu irşat için gönderildiğine inanılan Hacı Bektaş-ı Velî'nin yol arkadaşı olduğu kabul ediliyor. Bu şekilde Ahmet Yesevî ile başlayıp, Hacı Bektaş-ı Veli, Hacım Sultan ve Şeyh Dedebalı ile neticelenen zincirin halkalarıyla Yesevî geleneği inşa edilmiş oluyor. Menakıp kitaplarında anlatılanların arşiv belgeleri ile karşılaştırılıp birleştirilmesiyle 13. Yüzyıl Orta ve Batı Anadolu coğrafyasındaki toplumsal hayatın neredeyse 7-8 yüz yıllık serüveninin temel dinamikleri daha anlaşılır bir hale gelmeye başlıyor. 1220'lerde başlayan Moğol istilası, önündeki Celaleddin Harizmşah engelini de yıkarak Anadolu kapılarına dayandığı 1240'lı yıllardan itibaren bahsi geçen coğrafyayı her

bakımdan etkileyecek yeni toplumsal unsurların Anadolu'nun batı uçlarına doluşmasına sebep olmuştu. Bu süreçte bilhassa Harizmli askerî güçlerin ve yıkılan bu devletin tebaasını oluşturan toplumsal kesimlerin, geldikleri bu yeni topraklarda Babaîler isyanında olduğu gibi büyük sarsıntılara sebep oldukları gibi yeni beyliklerin teşekkülünde de etkili oldukları anlaşılıyor. Dönemin Batı Anadolu'sunda yaygın bir şekilde varlıkları tespit edilen Harizmli unsurlar içinde yer alan Dedebalı Cemaati ve bu cemaatle ilişkilendirilmesi gereken Şeyh Dedebalı, araştırma konumuzun çerçevesini oluşturuyor.

- **ZEYNEP OKTAY USLU,** Boğaziçi Üniversitesi

Beyond Doctrinal and Confessional Boundaries: The Religious Doctrine of Muhyiddin Abdal

Muhyiddin Abdal's (fl. 16th century) extant *Dīvān* is a rare source on the religious doctrines of the dervish movement known as the *Abdālān-ı Rūm*, who played a major role in the formation of both Alevism and Bektashism. Muhyiddin successfully pieces together doctrinal aspects of Hurufi, Twelver Shi'i, and Wujudi origins. Vocabulary specific to Alevi-Bektashi ritual and doctrine in Muhyiddin Abdal's *Dīvān* include *teberrā* (dissociation from the *ahl al-bayt*'s adversaries), *muṣāḥib* (brother of the hereafter), and *tercümān* (Alevi-Bektashi prayer), in addition to the *āl-i ʿabāʾ* (People of the Mantle), the Fourteen Pure Innocents (*çārdeh maʿṣūm-ı pāk*), and the seventeen belt-wearers (*onyedi kemer-best*). In line with other recent studies, such examples demonstrate that Alevi-Bektashi liturgy and social organization had crystallized by the sixteenth century, and that the Abdals played a major role in this process. On the other hand, Muhyiddin Abdal's confessional plurality, evidenced by elements of Sunni, Hurufi, and Alevi doctrine in his work, indicates that the Sunni and Alevi confessionalization of the period may not have been a major dynamic for the Abdals.

- **YELİZ TEBER,** University of Oxford

The Establishment of the Leadership at the Shrine of Hacı Bektaş:
The Spiritual Descent of the Çelebis in Light of New Evidence

This paper explores a key, yet long-standing question in Alevi-Bektashi scholarship: how did the Çelebis, the descendants of Hacı Bektaş, establish themselves as the legitimate sheikh family at the shrine of Hacı Bektaş near Kırşehir in Ottoman Anatolia? The Çelebis were arguably the most influential historical actors in Bektashism, but memory of them has mostly faded for various reasons. This paper aims to partially restore this memory through a hitherto unknown Sufi diploma (*ijāza*) of one Mahmud Çelebi. An examination of this document in comparison to other pieces of evidence suggests that although the early period of the Çelebis' leadership in the late thirteenth and the fourteenth centuries remains unknown, the Çelebis of the late fifteenth century legitimised their leadership at the shrine probably on the basis of their spiritual descent (*nefes evlādı*) to Hacı Bektaş. This finding not only starkly counters the allegation of today's Çelebis who claim a biological descent (*bel evlādı*) to Hacı Bektaş, but also allows us to revisit the consensus about the conflicts between the Çelebis and the celibate dervishes over the legacy of Hacı Bektaş at the time.

- **PEYMAN ESHAGHİ,** Free University of Berlin
From Anatolia and Balkans to Khurasan and Mashhad: A History of Transborder Relationships between the Bektashis and Shrine of Imam Ali al-Riza

Bektashis, who are living in Anatolia and the Balkans, have established a long history of cultural relationships with different elements in the Khurasan district and the city of Mashhad for centuries. The birthplace of Haji Bektash Veli and the grave of Imam Ali al-Riza are among the essential components of this connection. Bektashis were and still are engaging with these issues both materially and non-materially. On the one hand, there were/are making a pilgrimage to these places, established worship places, and developed pious gathering centers. On the other hand, they incorporated matters related to Imam al-Riza in their daily lives. In this article and based on the documents and primary sources preserved in the central library of the Imam Riza's shrine, ethnography at Bektashi religious places, and digital ethnography of Bektashi presence in the social media, I try to provide a cultural history of the connection found between a religious sect and a shrine. I argue that this connection comprises material and non-material elements, has developed upon the requirements of each era, and has established transborder, transimperial, and transnational relations in terms of pilgrimage traditions, religious places, and cultural creativity.

- **GÜLAY YILMAZ,** Akdeniz Üniversitesi
Janissary Identity in the Making: Coerced Labor, Warrior Masculinity, and Bektashism

Until seventeenth century the *devşirme* system remained as the main method of manning the janissary army. This was no simple conscription. It required an intense identity formation that would transform Christian adolescent boys into Muslim warriors fighting for Islam and the sultan. The training that boys and youth received was composed of several aspects including a harsh and disciplined physical training, learning Turkish and Islamic practices, and a mental formation that would give them a certain perception of their manhood. Bektashi belief system was an important supporting element in this transformation, as they were known as *zümre-i Bektaşiyan*. In this paper, I will examine the prominent components of janissary training. First, I will investigate the function of coerced labor in the boys' transformation. Then, I will emphasize the centrality of structured and intensive training with weapons in becoming professional warriors. Finally, I will investigate the masculine identity which was fed by a communal way of life in barracks as celibate soldiers, and by notions of military prowess, brotherhood and comrade solidarity that were strengthened through Bektashism. These dynamics will be investigated closely in the paper, through examining poems by janissary Bektashi poets as well as archival sources.

- **ALEX KREGER,** University of Texas, Austin
Let's not listen to the *hoca*": Stamping out scriptural monotheism in Alevi communal rituals

In response to the rise of Islamic populism in Turkey, Alevis have initiated a series of reforms and pedagogical practices aimed at purifying their rituals of elements of scriptural monotheism. *Muhabbet* (love/conversation), a genre of intimate sociality centered around music performed on the long-necked lute *saz*, is a particularly important site of such reforms. This paper examines how Alevis deal with the incursion in their *muhabbet* rituals of scripturalist discourses, or those

discourses concerned with distinguishing religious truth from falsehood. I consider three cases of scriptural incursion from my fieldwork: (1) the call to prayer, (2) the attempt to ascertain the actions of an historical Ali as a guide for ethical conduct in the present, and (3) questions aimed at determining and fixing the relationship of Alevism to Islam. Drawing on conversation analysis and sound studies approaches, I argue that music provides Alevis with a means of stamping out scripturalist discourses as they crop up during communal rituals. In this way, music helps Alevis maintain ritual continuity both in the immediate context of ritual interaction and historically over time.

▪ **ANGELA ANDERSEN**, University of Victoria
When the *Meydan* Becomes the *Dar*: Mansur al-Hallaj, Monotheism, and Sacrifice

Al-Husayn ibn Mansur al-Hallaj (857–922) is best known for his exclamation "En al Hakk" (I am Truth), understood by some as a blasphemous pronouncement of his own divinity. For others, this was an impassioned declaration of monotheism that is associated with his martyrdom. At a key moment in the Alevi liturgy, the *meydan*, the spatial centre of the *cem* ceremony, is collectively envisioned as the execution site itself, the *dar* of Mansur. The emblematic *dar* or gallows was made from a tree, but in known *cem* iterations, there are no objects that facilitate this conceptual change to the *meydan*, so that it is through contemplation of Mansur's sacrifice that his lesson is shared in movement and in verse. I will look to contemporary enactments of the Alevi *cem* and the *Buyruk* texts to consider the role of Mansur al-Hallaj in Alevi practice, ceremonial spatialization, and architecture. Comparisons of the role and meaning of Mansur in Alevi teachings and spaces, contextualized with Rum Seljuk and Ottoman depictions of the martyrdom, will be engaged to explore the *dar* as a distillation of the concept of Unity of Being and the emphasis on the role of the allegory of sacrifice in Alevism.

▪ **IRENE MARKOFF,** York University
The Dynamics of Ritual and the Alevi-Bektaşi *Cem* in Canada and Bulgaria: In Search of New Theoretical paradigms.

In this paper, I will explore the use of theoretical paradigms from anthropology to analyze various aspects of the contemporary Alevi *cem* based on the multi-sited fieldwork I have conducted in urban Turkish, urban Canadian, and rural Bulgarian contexts. My analysis will avoid detailed documentation of the specificities of structure and process present in the sacred assemblies I witnessed as such scholarly orientations already exist in the literature. Instead, I will draw from my ethnographic research in Toronto, Canada, and rural Bulgaria to utilize new tools for theorizing rituals. These theoretical tools include ritual reflexivity, a concept used by Kreineth and Sariönder (2018) to address reasons for transformation in the experience of Turkish urban *cem* performance, and Kapferer's (2010) notion of ritual dynamics that speaks to the aesthetic processes that generate transformative experiences within ritual space, the orientation of participants within that space and how they interrelate as they experience affect and *communitas*. Kapferer's approach will be especially useful in revealing a deeper understanding of grassroots Baba'i and Bektaşi *cem* rituals in Bulgaria's northeastern Deliorman region and the Eastern Rhodope Mountains in the south, with their intrinsic, intimate nature.

- **ÖZKAN KARABULUT**, Harvard University
Buyruk as an Anthology of Alevi Poetry Tradition: A Preliminary Study

Menakıb-ı Şeyh Safi known as *Buyruk* (lit. command) among Alevis provides an authoritative account of basic Kizilbash-Alevi beliefs, rituals, and poetry. This paper treats *Buyruk* as an anthology, where Alevi mystical poetry was penned both intext and appended at the back pages of it. As such, this paper analyzes the poetry in terms of contextuality, functionality, and poets. Additionally, it traces to what extent Alevi mystical poetry written in *Buyruk* manuscripts made its way into oblong poetry notebooks, known as *cönk*. Through an analysis of intertextuality and functional coexistence of *Buyruk* and *cönk*s, this paper aims to bring new insight into the scripturalization of Alevi mystical poetry and formation of Alevi liturgical canonization.

- **MEHMET DAĞLAR,** Iğdır Üniversitesi
Mistik Dervişler ve Safevi Devleti ile İlişkileri

16. yüzyıl başlarında İran'da kurulan Safevi Devleti'nin benimsediği On İki imam Şiiliğine aykırı olarak görülen dini zümrelerle ilişkileri sorunlu bir şekilde sürmüştür. Şeriata aykırı davranışlarda bulundukları gerekçesiyle Kalenderiler, Haydariler, Haksariler gibi derviş grupları devletin baskısı ve gözetimi altına alınmıştır. Resmi mezhep olan Şiiliğin İran'da yayılmasının hızlanmasına paralel olarak bu grupların tekkeleri kapatılarak faaliyet alanları kısıtlanmıştır. Çalışmamızda başta Kalenderiler başta olmak üzere çeşitli mistik derviş gruplarının Safeviler ile ilişkileri üzerinde durulacaktır.

- **GENNADY KURIN,** University of Oxford
The Shah's Retrospect, or the Five Stories of Tahmasp-e Safavi: Notes Towards a Textual History

"In this paper, by analyzing a corpus of over twenty manuscripts and focusing on themes of reception, transmission, and para-textual evolution, I shall attempt to tell a story of the text commonly known in English as *Shah Tahmasp's memoirs*, *diary* or even *autobiography*, from its composition to the eventual evolution into the book we know today as his *tezkereh*. I will thus argue that the *dominant* variant of the text – upon which virtually all its modern editions are based – was not in fact written by Tahmasp. Instead, is a considerably revised and differently framed version of the *ur-text*, originally composed in the early 1560s, containing several para-textual layers and likely produced for the benefit of Shah Sultan Hosayn (d. 1726) around the time of his eleventh birthday in early October 1679. In addition, this 'edition' seems to have been prepared by a member of the Shaykhvand-Mara'shi circles, the group likewise behind the composition of the popular historico-hagiographical accounts of the lives and exploits of the first two Safavid shahs (i.e., *'Alam-ara-ye Safaviyeh*, *'Alam-ara-ye Shah Tahmasp*), pointing to the persistent importance of the Qezelbash-Sufi memory of the earlier generations for the late Safavid society, a lead I shall attempt to explore."

- **SAMUEL A. HUCKLEBERRY,** University of St Andrews
When Slaves were Disciples: The *Ghulam* and the Qizilbash in the Safavid Realm

Conventional narratives of Safavid history suggest that the turn of the seventeenth century signaled the dynasty's turn way from the Qizilbash disciples whose ancestors paved the way for the family to establish a state a century before. These disciples were replaced, it is often said, by a new elite: military slaves or *ghulam*. The most powerful of these, deriving from landed military elites in the Caucasus, were appointed military and political power – including as chiefs of Qizilbash 'tribes'. With some of these elites having been well acquainted with the customs of the Qizilbash, surprisingly little has been written about the relationship between the Qizilbash and the *ghulam*. This paper explores the Qizilbash-*ghulam* relationship and its development until the mid-seventeenth century to argue for an intertwined picture. Rather than viewing Safavid history as a zero-sum game, in which the dynasty distanced itself from their disciples to prioritize Imamate Shi'ism, what emerges is each side contending with political reforms by the dynasty both were 'married' into.

- **FERENC CSİRKES,** Sabancı University
Qizilbash Literature in Late Safavid and Afsharid Iran: Resistance and Piety on the Borderland

The paper discusses how identity was negotiated in popular Turkophone poetic discourse at the time of the final collapse of Safavid rule and the rise of Nādir Shah's regime in Iran. As a case study, I will focus on the unique copy of the divan of a little-known poet by the pen-name Raḥīmā, who lived in the vicinity of Tabriz and was likely at the head of a local Sufi network. I will argue that Raḥīmā's poetry, especially his anti-Ottoman propaganda pieces, his versified commentary on problems in Islamic law, and his narrative poems about the Hajj, are best to be analyzed against the background of confessionalization and linguistic and literary vernacularization in both the aforesaid realms in the previous ca. two and a half centuries. Situating the manuscript in the context of Nādir Shah's religio-political experimentation and his attempt to have Twelver Shiism accepted as the fifth Sunni legal school, I will also claim that there was a distinct local literary and confessional discourse in Turkophone Qizilbash networks that was not dominated by the religio-political center, but was constructed in a dynamic dialogue with it and appealed to local sensibilities.

- **NABIL AL-TİKRİTİ,** University of Mary Washington
Revisiting the Şahkulu and Nur Ali Halife Rebellions

In March 1511, immediately following the sudden, unexpected, and unauthorized departure of Şehzade Korkud (d. 1513) from his post in Antalya for Saruhan, a rebellion broke out throughout the Teke region. Within days this rebellion spread throughout Anatolia under the charismatic leadership of Şahkulu (d. 1511). Later portrayed as an existential threat to the entire empire, this rebellion – along with a subsequent rebellion led by Nur Ali Halife (d. 1515) – has been used to justify a hardening imperial stance against those described as "Kızılbaş" in the years to follow. With this paper, I plan to delve into the relevant sources in order to revisit certain widespread perceptions connected to these twin rebellions, clarify what was said when, and explore alternative interpretations of the events that transpired. To what extent was the Şahkulu rebellion

pre-planned and supported by external actors? What motivated the rebellion, and why did it spread so rapidly? Did the rebels practice cannibalism at one point? In attempting to answer such questions, I also hope to offer preliminary conclusions concerning the reliability of Ottoman narrative sources covering the rebellion.

- **MİHRİBAN ARTAN,** Nevşehir Hacı Bektaş Veli Üniversitesi)
Şahkulu Ayaklanması'nın Osmanlılara, Safevîlere ve Kızılbaşlara Etkisi

1511 yılında zuhur eden Şahkulu Ayaklanması Osmanlıları, Safevîleri ve Kızılbaşları birçok açıdan etkilemiştir. Söz konusu ayaklanma ziraî/iktisadî/sosyal hayatta mevcut olan sarsıntıları daha da derinleştirmiş ve adeta kaotik bir ortam yaratmıştır. Binlerce ev yakılmış, birçok insan esir edilmiş/öldürülmüş ve birçok yer tahrip edilmiştir. Ayaklanmadan sonra Osmanlı Devleti'nin saltanatının kaderi de tayin edilmiştir. Padişah adayı olarak Şehzade Ahmed yerine Selim başa gelmiş ve fetih yönünü Doğu'ya çevirmiştir. Bu durum Osmanlılar açısından olumlu bir siyaset ve gelişme fırsatı yaratırken, Safevî gibi gelişmekte olan bir devletin de gücünü kırmıştır. Şahkulu Ayaklanması'nın Kızılbaşlara etkisi ise daha yıkıcı olmuştur. Zira ayaklanmadan sonra Osmanlı Devleti Kızılbaşlara karşı sıkı tedbirler almış, fetvalar vermeye başlamış ve böylece Osmanlılarla Kızılbaşlar arasındaki manevi ve sosyal ilişkiler onarılamayacak bir şekilde yara almıştır. Osmanlı Devleti'nin Kızılbaşlara karşı sert tutumu ilerleyen dönemlerde de Anadolu'da bir dizi ayaklanmanın zuhuruna neden olacaktır. Şahkulu Ayaklanması'ndan sonra Osmanlı'nın Sünnî mezhebine doğru, Kızılbaşların da teolojik olarak kendilerine yakın olan Safevîyye Tarikatına eğiliminin arttığını söylemek mümkündür. Böylece Anadolu'da bir mezhebî ayrışma hız kazanmıştır. Sunumumuzda, ayaklanmanın Osmanlılara, Safevîlere ve Kızılbaşlara yukarıda bahsedilen tarihi mahiyetteki etkileri; dönemin raporları, mektupları, Osmanlı kronikleri ve Safevî kaynakları ışığında ortaya konulacaktır.

- **ŞÜKRÜ ILICAK,** University of Crete, Institute for Mediterranean Studies
The Greek War of Independence and the Demise of The Janissary Complex; A New Interpretation of the 'Auspicious Incident

There has been a remarkable and curious tendency among Ottomanists to unlink the abolition of the Janissary complex (in other words, the commencement of Ottoman/Turkish modernity) from the Greek War of Independence (namely, the uprising of a subject people) against whom, exactly a century later, the "Turks" would happen to conduct their own war of independence and create their own national narrative, myths and stereotypes. I argue that it was the Greek Revolution's unsettling effects that paved the way for momentous changes in the dynamics between the Ottoman state and society and created a specific moral universe that enabled the central state elite to stifle social dissent and create, as well as impose, a conformism within Muslim society regarding the abolition of the janissary complex.

- **BEDRİYE POYRAZ,** Ankara University
Forced Resettlement of *Dersim 38* as the first Alevi Migration in the History of the Turkish Republic

It is known that the migration of Alevis to big cities started in the 60s and 70s. However, in order to discuss the concepts of Alevi and migration together and with a historical approach, it is necessary to look at the migration experience of Alevis from Dersim, who were subjected to forced

resettlement, that is, forced migration. In this sense, the compulsory Alevi resettlement/Alevi migration, as an element of the *Dersim 38 massacre*, is a phenomenon that was organized by the state itself, with long-term preparations, legal regulations, and coordination of almost all the important institutions of the State. In this presentation, I will try to present the context of Dersim's unique historical relationship with the political authority, through official documents on the topic and the stories of the people who were subjected to forced resettlement.

- **CEREN LORD,** St Antony's College, University of Oxford
The Alevi Movement's Contentious Politics in the Era of Authoritarianism

This paper will examine the Alevi movement in the context of growing authoritarianism in Turkey. Despite the promise of equal citizenship following the creation of the Turkish Republic, Alevis continue to face discrimination and periodic violence, often perceived as an internal enemy. Prior to 2011, the Islamist AKP (Justice and Development Party) government's policies towards Alevis were in continuity with previous state practices, including its engagement with the Alevi movement as part of the so-called 'Alevi opening' launched in 2007. However, driven by a confluence of external (Arab uprisings) and internal challenges (2013 Gezi protests, 2016 coup attempts) to the regime, the AKP has adopted increasingly sectarian discourses and practices since 2011, with parallels to similar trends across the Middle East. Accordingly, this paper will discuss the Alevi movement's contentious politics by: i) contextualising current sectarianised state practices against Alevis by showing how sectarianism was embedded in early processes of nation-building while tracing evolving state strategies, including those pursued by the Islamic authority (Presidency of Religious Affairs), over time; ii) outlining elements of change and continuity in state strategies towards Alevis in the AKP era; iii) explore the Alevi movement's contentious politics in response to the in response to the AKP's sectarianised securitisation.

- **KUDRET NEZİR YUNUSOĞLU,** İstanbul Üniversitesi
Intrafaith Debates among Alevis Analyzed in the Light of Thomas Bauer's Theory of Ambiguity (In)tolerance

In contradistinction to the Alevi faith's historical heritage of multifariousness, the last decade has witnessed the rapid rise of an intra-faith intolerance manifested by different Alevi groups who make claims to representing the one and only true authoritative form of Alevism. In *A Culture of Ambiguity and Die Vereindeutigung der Welt,* Thomas Bauer examines the question of tolerance for ambiguity in the Islamic World and describes the contemporary state of ascending intolerance as linked to the rise of a fundamentalist set of paradigms propagating 1) the singularity of Truth 2) that is beyond historicity 3) and maintained in a state of purity. In order to expose the nature of the rising intra-faith intolerance among Alevis as a contemporary desire reminiscent of "fundamentalist" intolerance for ambiguity, I intend to focus mainly on some highly active Alevi social media pages and a selection of recent books (by both "traditionalists" and "reformists") that display the desire for mastery over the Alevi faith.